A Functional Space Model

COS 326 David Walker Princeton University

Last Time



0

type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree





This Time

Understanding the space complexity of functional programs

- At least two interesting components:
 - the amount of *live space* at any instant in time
 - the *rate of allocation*
 - a function call may not change the amount of live space by much but may allocate at a substantial rate
 - because functional programs act by generating new data structures and discarding old ones, they often allocate at a great rate
 - » OCaml garbage collector is optimized with this in mind
 - » interesting fact: at the assembly level, the number of writes made by a function program is typically roughly the same as the number of writes by an imperative program

This Time

Understanding the space complexity of functional programs

- At least two interesting components:
 - the amount of *live space* at any instant in time
 - the *rate of allocation*
 - a function call may not change the amount of live space by much but may allocate at a substantial rate
 - because functional programs act by generating new data structures and discarding old ones, they often allocate at a great rate
 - » OCaml garbage collector is optimized with this in mind
 - » interesting fact: at the assembly level, the number of writes made by a function program is typically roughly the same as the number of writes by an imperative program

- What takes up space?

- conventional first-order data: tuples, lists, strings, datatypes
- function representations (closures)
- the call stack

CONVENTIONAL DATA

```
let rec insert (t:tree) (i:int) =
match t with
Leaf -> Node (i, Leaf, Leaf)
| Node (j, left, right) ->
if i <= j then
Node (j, insert left i, right)
else
Node (j, left, insert right i)</pre>
```



















































Whenever you use a constructor, space is allocated:



Total space allocated is proportional to the height of the tree.

~ log n, if tree with n nodes is balanced



```
let check_option (o:int option) : int option =
  match o with
    Some _ -> o
    None -> failwith "found none"
;;
```

```
let check_option (o:int option) : int option =
  match o with
    Some j -> Some j
    None -> failwith "found none"
;;
```

```
let check_option (o:int option) : int option =
  match o with
    Some _ -> o
    None -> failwith "found none"
;;
```

```
allocates nothing when arg is Some i
```

```
let check_option (o:int option) : int option =
  match o with
    Some j -> Some j
    None -> failwith "found none"
;;
```

allocates an option when arg is Some i

```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   let c2 = c1 in
   cadd c1 c2
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   cadd c1 c1
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    cadd (x1,y1) (x1,y1)
;;
```

```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   let c2 = c1 in
   cadd c1 c2
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   cadd c1 c1
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    cadd (x1,y1) (x1,y1)
;;
```



```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   let c2 = c1 in
   cadd c1 c2
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   cadd c1 c1
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    cadd (x1,y1) (x1,y1)
;;
```



```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   let c2 = c1 in
   cadd c1 c2
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   cadd c1 c1
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    cadd (x1,y1) (x1,y1)
;;
```



```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   let c2 = c1 in
   cadd c1 c2
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
   cadd c1 c1
;;
```

```
let double (c1:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    cadd (x1,y1) (x1,y1)
;;
```

cadd allocates double does not

cadd allocates double does not

cadd allocates double allocates 2 pairs

```
let cadd (c1:int*int) (c2:int*int) : int*int =
    let (x1,y1) = c1 in
    let (x2,y2) = c2 in
      (x1+x2, y1+y2)
;;
```



extracts components; does not allocate

FUNCTION CLOSURES

Consider the following program:

```
let choose (arg:bool * int * int) : int -> int =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
        (fun n -> n + x)
    else
        (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```

Consider the following program:

```
let choose (arg:bool * int * int) : int -> int =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
      (fun n -> n + x)
    else
      (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```



Consider the following program:

```
let choose (arg:bool * int * int) : int -> int =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
      (fun n -> n + x)
    else
      (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```

```
choose (true, 1, 2)
-->
let (b, x, y) = (true, 1, 2) in
if b then (fun n -> n + x)
else (fun n -> n + y)
```

Consider the following program:

```
let choose (arg:bool * int * int) : int -> int =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
      (fun n -> n + x)
    else
      (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```

```
choose (true, 1, 2)
-->
let (b, x, y) = (true, 1, 2) in
if b then (fun n -> n + x)
else (fun n -> n + y)
-->
if true then (fun n -> n + 1)
else (fun n -> n + 2)
```

Consider the following program:

```
let choose (arg:bool * int * int) : int -> int =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
      (fun n -> n + x)
    else
      (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```

```
choose (true, 1, 2)
-->
let (b, x, y) = (true, 1, 2) in
if b then (fun n -> n + x)
else (fun n -> n + y)
-->
if true then (fun n -> n + 1)
else (fun n -> n + 2)
-->
(fun n -> n + 1)
```

```
let choose arg =
    let (b, x, y) = arg in
    if b then
        (fun n -> n + x)
    else
        (fun n -> n + y)
;;
choose (true, 1, 2);;
```











What we aren't going to do

The substitution model of evaluation is *just a model*. It says that we generate new code at each step of a computation. We don't do that in reality. Too expensive!

The substitution model is a faithful model for reasoning about program correctness but it doesn't help us understand what is going on at the machine-code level

- that's a good thing! *abstraction!!*
- you should almost never think about machine code when writing a program. We invented high-level programming languages so you don't have to.

Still, we need to have a more faithful space model in order to understand how to write efficient algorithms.
Some functions are easy to implement



If no functions in ML were nested then compiling ML would be just like compiling C. (Take COS 320 to find out how to do that...)

How do we implement functions?

Let's remove the nesting and compile them like we compile C.



How do we implement functions?

Let's remove the nesting and compile them like we compile C.



Darn! *Doesn't work naively*. Nested functions contain *free variables*. Simple unnesting leaves them undefined.

How do we implement functions?

We can't define a function like the following using code alone:

let f2 n = n + y;;

A *closure* is a pair of some code and an environment:



closure

Closure conversion (also called lambda lifting) converts open, nested functions in to closed, top-level functions.

```
let choose arg =
   let (b, x, y) = arg in
   if b then
      (fun n -> n + x + y)
   else
      (fun n -> n + y)
;;
```











Even though the original, non-closure-converted code was welltyped, the closure-converted code isn't because the environments are different



Even though the original, non-closure-converted code was welltyped, the closure-converted code isn't because the environments are different



fix I: type env = F1 of f1_env | F2 of f2_env
type f1_clos = (int * env -> int) * env
type f2_clos = (int * env -> int) * env

Even though the original, non-closure-converted code was welltyped, the closure-converted code isn't because the environments are different



Even though the original, non-closure-converted code was welltyped, the closure-converted code isn't because the environments are different



Aside: Existential Types

map has a *universal* polymorphic type:

map : ('a -> 'b) -> 'a list -> 'b list "for *all* types 'a and for *all* types 'b, ..."

when we closure-convert a function that has type int -> int, we get a function with *existential* polymorphic type:

exists 'a. ((int * 'a) -> int) * 'a "there *exists some* type 'a such that, ..."

In OCaml, we can approximate existential types using datatypes (a data type allows you to say "there exists a type 'a drawn from one of the following finite number of options." In Haskell, you've got the real thing.



The Space Cost of Closures

The space cost of a closure

- = the cost of the pair of code and environment pointers
- + the cost of the data referred to by function free variables

TAIL CALLS AND CONTINUATIONS

Some Innocuous Code

```
(* sum of 0..n *)
let rec sum_to (n:int) : int =
    if n > 0 then
        n + sum_to (n-1)
    else 0
;;
let big_int = 1000000;;
sum big_int;;
```

Let's try it.

(Go to tail.ml)

Some Other Code

Four functions: Green works on big inputs; Red doesn't.

```
let sum to2 (n: int) : int =
  let rec aux (n:int) (a:int) : int =
   if n > 0 then
    aux (n-1) (a+n)
  else a
  in
  aux n 0
                                   let rec sum2 (l:int list) : int =
;;
                                     match 1 with
                                          [] -> 0
                                        | hd::tail -> hd + sum2 tail
                                   ;;
let rec sum to (n:int) : int =
 if n > 0 then
  n + sum to (n-1)
 else O
;;
                                   let sum (l:int list) : int =
                                     let rec aux (l:int list) (a:int) : int =
                                       match 1 with
                                            [] -> a
```

in

;;

aux 1 0

| hd::tail -> aux tail (a+hd)

Some Other Code

Four functions: Green works on big inputs; Red doesn't.

```
let sum to2 (n: int) : int =
  let rec aux (n:int) (a:int) : int =
    if n > 0 then
    aux (n-1) (a+n)
    else a
  in
  aux n 0
                                    let rec sum2 (l:int list) : int =
;;
                                      match 1 with
                                          [] -> 0
                                        | hd::tail -> hd + sum2 tail
                                    ;;
let rec sum to (n:int) : int =
 if n > 0 then
  n + sum to (n-1)
  else O
;;
                                    let sum (l:int list) : int =
                                      let rec aux (l:int list) (a:int) : int =
                                        match 1 with
   code that works:
                                             [] -> a
                                          hd::tail -> aux tail (a+hd)
   no computation after
                                      in
   recursive function call
                                      aux 1 0
                                    ;;
```

Tail Recursion

A *tail-recursive function* is a function that does no work after it calls itself recursively.

Tail Recursion

A *tail-recursive function* is a function that does no work after it calls itself recursively.

Tail-recursive:



Tail Recursion

A *tail-recursive function* is a function that does no work after it calls itself recursively.

Not tail-recursive:

```
sum_to 1000000
-->
1000000 + sum_to 99999
-->
1000000 + 99999 + sum_to 99998
-->
...
1000000 + 99999 + 99998 + ... + sum_to 0
-->
1000000 + 99999 + 99998 + ... + 0
-->
... add it all back up ...
```

```
(* sum of 0..n *)
let rec sum_to (n:int) : int =
    if n > 0 then
        n + sum_to (n-1)
    else 0
;;
let big_int = 1000000;;
sum big int;;
```

expression grows at every recursive call

Memory is partitioned: Stack and Heap

heap space (big!)



Data Needed on Return Saved on Stack



Can any non-tail-recursive function be transformed in to a tailrecursive one?



not only is sum2 tail-recursive but it reimplements an algorithm that took *linear space* (on the stack) using an algorithm that executes in *constant space*!

Can any non-tail-recursive function be transformed in to a tailrecursive one? Yes, if we can capture the *differential* between a tail-recursive function and a non-tail-recursive one.

```
let rec sum (l:int list) : int =
  match l with
  [] -> 0
  | hd::tail -> hd + sum tail
;;
```

Idea: Focus on what happens after the recursive call.

Can any non-tail-recursive function be transformed in to a tailrecursive one? Yes, if we can capture the *differential* between a tail-recursive function and a non-tail-recursive one.



Idea: Focus on what happens after the recursive call.

Extracting that piece:



How do we capture it?











Execution

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
  [] -> k 0
  | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum_cont l (fun s -> s)
```

sum [1;2]

Execution

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
  [] -> k 0
  | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
   [] -> k 0
   | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
```

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
   [] -> k 0
   | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum_cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
-->
sum cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
```

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
  [] -> k 0
  | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum_cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
-->
sum_cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
-->
(fun s -> (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s)) 0
```

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
   [] -> k 0
   | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum_cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
-->
sum_cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
-->
(fun s -> (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s)) 0
-->
(fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + 0))
```

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
  [] -> k 0
  | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum_cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
-->
sum_cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
-->
(fun s -> (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s)) 0
-->
(fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + 0))
-->
(fun s -> s) (1 + (2 + 0))
```

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
   [] -> k 0
   | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
    sum cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
    sum cont [2] (fun s \rightarrow (fun s \rightarrow s) (1 + s));;
-->
    sum cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
-->
     (fun s \rightarrow (fun s \rightarrow (fun s \rightarrow s) (1 + s)) (2 + s)) 0
-->
     (fun s \rightarrow (fun s \rightarrow s) (1 + s)) (2 + 0))
-->
     (fun s -> s) (1 + (2 + 0))
-->
    1 + (2 + 0)
-->
    3
```

Question

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
   [] -> k 0
   | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum (l:int list) : int = sum cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
sum [1;2]
-->
sum_cont [1;2] (fun s -> s)
-->
sum_cont [2] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s));;
-->
sum_cont [] (fun s -> (fun s -> s) (1 + s)) (2 + s))
-->
...
-->
3
```

Where did the stack space go?

CPS

CPS:

- short for *Continuation-Passing Style*
- Every function takes a continuation as an argument that expresses "what to do next"
- CPS functions only call other functions as the last thing they do

CORRECTNESS OF A CPS TRANSFORM

Are the two functions the same?

```
type cont = int -> int;;
let rec sum_cont (l:int list) (k:cont): int =
  match l with
  [] -> k 0
  | hd::tail -> sum_cont tail (fun s -> k (hd + s)) ;;
let sum2 (l:int list) : int = sum_cont l (fun s -> s)
```

```
let rec sum (l:int list) : int =
   match l with
   [] -> 0
   | hd::tail -> hd + sum tail
;;
```

Here, it is really pretty tricky to be sure you've done it right if you don't prove it. Let's try to prove this theorem and see what happens:

```
for all l:int list,
   sum_cont l (fun x => x) == sum l
```

```
for all 1:int list, sum_cont 1 (fun s -> s) == sum 1
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case 1 = []
...
case: hd::tail
IH: sum_cont tail (fun s -> s) == sum tail
```

```
for all l:int list, sum_cont l (fun s -> s) == sum l
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
...
case: hd::tail
IH: sum_cont tail (fun s -> s) == sum tail
sum_cont (hd::tail) (fun s -> s)
==
```

```
for all l:int list, sum_cont l (fun s -> s) == sum l
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
...
case: hd::tail
IH: sum_cont tail (fun s -> s) == sum tail
sum_cont (hd::tail) (fun s -> s)
== sum_cont tail (fn s' -> (fn s -> s) (hd + s')) (eval)
```

```
for all l:int list, sum_cont l (fun s -> s) == sum l
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
...
case: hd::tail
IH: sum_cont tail (fun s -> s) == sum tail
sum_cont (hd::tail) (fun s -> s)
== sum_cont tail (fn s' -> (fn s -> s) (hd + s')) (eval)
== sum_cont tail (fn s' -> hd + s') (eval -- hd + s' valuable)
```



```
for all l:int list,
   for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
```

must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont [] k == k (sum [])

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
  must prove: for all k:int->int, sum_cont [] k == k (sum [])
  pick an arbitrary k:
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
  must prove: for all k:int->int, sum_cont [] k == k (sum [])
  pick an arbitrary k:
     sum_cont [] k
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = []
  must prove: for all k:int->int, sum_cont [] k == k (sum [])
  pick an arbitrary k:
     sum_cont [] k
     == match [] with [] -> k 0 | hd::tail -> ... (eval)
     == k 0 (eval)
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = []
  must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont [] k == k (sum [])
  pick an arbitrary k:
     sum cont [] k
  == match [] with [] \rightarrow k 0 | hd::tail \rightarrow ... (eval)
  == k 0
                                                       (eval)
```

== k (sum [])

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = []
  must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont [] k == k (sum [])
  pick an arbitrary k:
    sum cont [] k
  == match [] with [] \rightarrow k 0 | hd::tail \rightarrow ... (eval)
  == k 0
                                                        (eval)
  == k (0)
                                                        (eval, reverse)
  == k (match [] with [] \rightarrow 0 | hd::tail \rightarrow ...) (eval, reverse)
  == k (sum [])
case done!
```

```
for all l:int list,
   for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
```

```
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
```

```
case l = [] ===> done!
```

```
case l = hd::tail
```

IH: for all k':int->int, sum cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)

Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list l.
case l = [] ===> done!
case l = hd::tail
  IH: for all k':int->int, sum_cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)
  Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum_cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))
  Pick an arbitrary k,
```

```
sum cont (hd::tail) k
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = [] ===> done!
case l = hd::tail
  IH: for all k':int->int, sum cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)
  Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))
  Pick an arbitrary k,
     sum cont (hd::tail) k
  == sum cont tail (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + x)) (eval)
```

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = [] = \Rightarrow done!
case l = hd::tail
  IH: for all k':int->int, sum cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)
  Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))
  Pick an arbitrary k,
     sum cont (hd::tail) k
  == sum cont tail (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + x)) (eval)
  == (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + s)) (sum tail) (IH with IH quantifier k'
                                                replaced with (fun x \rightarrow k (hd+x))
```

```
for all l:int list,
 for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = [] = \Rightarrow done!
case l = hd::tail
  IH: for all k':int->int, sum cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)
  Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))
  Pick an arbitrary k,
     sum cont (hd::tail) k
  == sum cont tail (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + x)) (eval)
  == (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + s)) (sum tail) (IH with IH quantifier k'
                                               replaced with (fun x \rightarrow k (hd+x))
  == k (hd + (sum tail))
                                                (eval, since sum total and
                                                       and sum tail valuable)
```

```
for all l:int list,
 for all k:int->int, sum cont l k == k (sum l)
Proof: By induction on the structure of the list 1.
case l = [] = \Rightarrow done!
case l = hd::tail
  IH: for all k':int->int, sum cont tail k' == k' (sum tail)
  Must prove: for all k:int->int, sum cont (hd::tail) k == k (sum (hd::tail))
 Pick an arbitrary k,
     sum cont (hd::tail) k
  == sum cont tail (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + x)) (eval)
  == (fun s \rightarrow k (hd + s)) (sum tail) (IH with IH quantifier k'
                                               replaced with (fun x \rightarrow k (hd+x))
  == k (hd + (sum tail))
                                                (eval, since sum total and
                                                       and sum tail valuable)
  == k (sum (hd:tail))
                                               (eval sum, reverse)
case done!
```

```
OED!
```

Finishing Up

Ok, now what we have is a proof of this theorem:

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
```

We can use that general theorem to get what we really want:

```
for all l:int list,
   sum2 l
== sum_cont l (fun s -> s) (by eval sum2)
== (fun s -> s) (sum l) (by theorem, instantiating k with (fun s -> s)
== sum l
```

So, we've show that the function sum2, which is tail-recursive, is functionally equivalent to the non-tail-recursive function sum.

SUMMARY

Summary of the CPS Proof

We tried to prove the *specific* theorem we wanted:

```
for all l:int list, sum_cont l (fun s -> s) == sum l
```

But it didn't work because in the middle of the proof, *the IH didn't apply* -- inside our function we had the wrong kind of continuation -- not (fun s -> s) like our IH required. So we had to *prove a more general theorem* about *all* continuations.

```
for all l:int list,
  for all k:int->int, sum_cont l k == k (sum l)
```

This is a common occurrence -- *generalizing the induction hypothesis* -- and it requires human ingenuity. It's why proving theorems is hard. It's also why writing programs is hard -- you have to make the proofs and programs work more generally, around every iteration of a loop.

Overall Summary

We developed techniques for reasoning about the space costs of functional programs

- the cost of *manipulating data types* like tuples and trees
- the cost of allocating and using function closures
- the cost of *tail-recursive* and non-tail-recursive *functions*

We also talked about some important program transformations:

- *closure conversion* makes nested functions with free variables in to pairs of closed code and environment
- the *continuation-passing style* (CPS) transformation turns non-tailrecursive functions in to tail-recursive ones that use no stack space
 - the stack gets moved in to the function closure
- since stack space is often small compared with heap space, it is often necessary to use *continuations and tail recursion*
 - but full CPS-converted programs are unreadable: use judgement

Challenge: CPS Convert the incr function

```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
  match t with
    Leaf -> Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr left i, incr right i)
;;
```

(see solution after the next slide)

END

CPS Convert the incr function

```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
  match t with
   Leaf -> Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr left i, incr right i)
;;
type cont = tree -> tree ;;
let rec incr cps (t:tree) (i:int) (k:cont) : tree =
  match t with
   Leaf -> k Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> ...
;;
```

```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
  match t with
    Leaf -> Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr left i, incr right i)
;;
```

first continuation:	Node (i+j,, incr right i)
second continuation:	Node (i+j, left_done,)
```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
  match t with
    Leaf -> Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr i left, incr i right)
;;
```

first continuation: fun left_done -> Node (i+j, left_done , incr right i)
second continuation: fun right_done -> k (Node (i+j, left_done, right_done))

```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
  match t with
    Leaf -> Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr left i, incr right i)
;;
```

```
second continuation
inside
first continuation:
```

```
fun left_done ->
  let k2 =
    (fun right_done ->
        k (Node (i+j, left_done, right_done))
    )
    in
    incr right i k2
```

```
type tree = Leaf | Node of int * tree * tree ;;
let rec incr (t:tree) (i:int) : tree =
 match t with
   Leaf -> Leaf
 | Node (j,left,right) -> Node (i+j, incr left i, incr right i)
;;
type cont = tree -> tree ;;
let rec incr cps (t:tree) (i:int) (k:cont) : tree =
 match t with
   Leaf -> k Leaf
  | Node (j,left,right) ->
     let k1 = (fun left done ->
                  let k^2 = (fun right done ->
                              k (Node (i+j, left done, right done)))
                  in
                  incr cps right i k2
      in
      incr cps left i k1
;;
let incr tail (t:tree) (i:int) : tree = incr cps t i (fun t -> t);;
```